Case 1:03-md-01570-GBD-SN Document 2059 Filed 12/21/07 Page 1 of 2

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORKx	DATE FILED: 12/21/07
IN RE: TERRORIST ATTACKS ON SEPTEMBER 11, 2001	ORDER 03 MDL 1570 (GBD)
GEORGE B. DANIELS, District Judge:	

The <u>Federal Insurance</u>, <u>Burnett</u>, <u>Ashton</u> and <u>O'Neill</u> plaintiffs seek discovery of the activities and relationship of the defendants as far back as 1988. They request that the Court strike the global objections, by defendants Muslim World League, International Islamic Relief Organization and Wa'el Jelaidan, to any discovery prior to 1996.

Plaintiffs maintain that discovery, pertaining to years prior to 1996, is directly relevant to their claims that those defendants aided and abetted, conspired with, and materially supported al Qaeda after it "was established in 1988 or earlier." Defendants contend that matters pre-dating 1998, or at the earliest 1996, are irrelevant because defendants were not put on notice of al Qaeda's terrorist activities towards the United States until Osama bin Laden's 1996 fatwah declaring war on Americans. Defendants further argue that the discovery sought is overly burdensome and outweighs any minimal benefit to plaintiffs.

Given the nature of the claims and defenses, the appropriate temporal scope of discovery should reasonably begin in 1992. 1992 is the year prior to the 1993 attacks against the United States, and the year when it is alleged that Osama bin Laden and other senior al Qaeda leadership issued a formal fatwah, specifically calling for jihad against the United States and other Western allies. If, after receipt and review of such discovery, plaintiffs can demonstrate that further pre-1992 discovery is warranted, such an application may be made to the Court, upon a specific showing of relevance as to a particular issue and defendant.

The objections asserted by these defendants to all pre-1996 discovery are hereby struck, to the extent that the defendants are directed to respond to plaintiffs' requests for discovery relating back to the period beginning in 1992.

Dated: New York, New York December 21, 2007

SO ORDERED:

GEORGE B. DANIELS
United States District Judge